



Thar Coal & Energy Board

Government of Sindh

**PRE-PROPOSAL BID MEETING OF CONSULTANT SELECTION COMMITTEE WITH
CONSULTANT FIRMS REGARDING SELECTION OF CONSULTANT FIRM FOR
CONDUCTING ENVIRONMENTAL AND SOCIAL STUDY / AUDIT POST COMMERCIAL
PRODUCTION SCENARIO IN THAR COALFIELD**

REFERENCE	Pre-proposal Bid Meeting
HELD ON	28 th July, 2021 (Wednesday) at 11:00 a.m.
VENUE	Committee room, Thar Coal & Energy Board 1 st Floor, State Life Building No.3, Dr. Ziauddin Ahmed Road, Opposite CM House, Karachi.

After introduction of all the participants, the Director (A&F), Thar Coal & Energy Board / Secretary, Consultant Selection Committee (CSC) presented an overview of the assignment including RFP documents. After detailed discussion all representatives of consulting firms shared their queries with the Chairman / Members of Selection Committee regarding RFP document for subject procurement.

2. Subsequently, the Chairman / Members of Consultant Selection Committee clarified one by one following query raised by Representatives of Consultant Firms. All queries alongwith clarifications are mentioned below:

Sr. No.	Queries	Reference Clause from the RFP document	Answer / Clarification
1	Keeping in view the timing constraints due to Eid Holidays, it is requested that proposal submission date may be extended for about two weeks in order to develop sound proposal after preliminary field visit.	1.5	As time will be required for clarifications and issue of an addendum that has to be issued in writing (as per clause 10.2, page 8) also has to be uploaded on SPPRA, the time for submission of proposal by August, 12, 2021 (clause 1.5 page 16) will be insufficient. The deadline for submission and opening of proposals is extended as per following schedule: Technical and Financial Proposals are to be submitted not later than 3:00 p.m. on 26.08.2021 and Technical Proposal shall be opened at 3:30 p.m. on same date and venue.
2	Mathematical Errors in Evaluation Criteria needs to be clarified.	13.1	The errors in Points system for the evaluation Criteria proposals clarified with a briefing note.
3	Key Personal are 06 Experts at page 17 and on page 50, the quantity is same but with different nomenclature. However, we propose 09 experts with evaluation points	-do-	On page 50 the nomenclature is identical to that on page 17 of RFP document, with the exception that the quantity remained six (06) instead of the desired nine (09).
4	Mode of payment is mentioned on Page 49 and 66 but quite different. This must be reasonably settled.	TORs (5) Deliverable and payment milestones	Page 49 to be the final page in terms of deliverables and payment milestones.

NO. TCEB/(A&F)/1-19/2021/6047
Dated : 30th July, 2021



Thar Coal & Energy Board

Government of Sindh

Decisions:

It was decided by the Consultant Selection Committee that following changes may be made in the RFP documents:

Sr. #	Reference RFP Document	Rephrased / Modified																																																																																																						
1.	Section-2- Data Sheet - Clause-1.5 (Date & Time submission and opening)	The deadline for submission and opening of proposals is extended as per following schedule: Technical and Financial Proposals are to be submitted not later than 3:00 p.m. on 26.08.2021 and Technical Proposal shall be opened at 3:30 p.m. on same date and venue.																																																																																																						
2.	Section-2 – Data Sheet Clause-13.1 (Preliminary Eligibility Criteria)	<p>Criteria, sub-criteria, and point system for the evaluation Criteria Modified as under:</p> <table border="1" style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <thead> <tr> <th style="width: 5%;">S#</th> <th style="width: 75%;">Evaluation Criteria</th> <th style="width: 10%;">Points</th> <th style="width: 10%;">Total Points</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">1</td> <td>Qualification & Experience</td> <td style="text-align: center;">30</td> <td style="text-align: center;">30</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">i</td> <td>Establishment of the applicant company</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">a</td> <td>Private limited</td> <td style="text-align: center;">06</td> <td rowspan="3" style="text-align: center; vertical-align: middle;">06 *</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">b</td> <td>Partnership concern</td> <td style="text-align: center;">04</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">c</td> <td>Sole proprietorship</td> <td style="text-align: center;">02</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">ii</td> <td>Experience</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">a</td> <td>At least 15 years of experience or more in environmental and/or social assessment (at least 08 projects), experience with international agencies.</td> <td style="text-align: center;">07</td> <td rowspan="2" style="text-align: center; vertical-align: middle;">10 *</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">b</td> <td>At least 02 number of environmental assessment of coal mining/power plant and other infrastructure projects in the region</td> <td style="text-align: center;">03</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">iii</td> <td>Financial capability</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">a</td> <td>Above 200 million</td> <td style="text-align: center;">14</td> <td rowspan="4" style="text-align: center; vertical-align: middle;">14 *</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">b</td> <td>150 – 200 Million</td> <td style="text-align: center;">12</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">c</td> <td>100-149 Million</td> <td style="text-align: center;">10</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">d</td> <td>50-99 Million</td> <td style="text-align: center;">08</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">2</td> <td>Approach and Methodology</td> <td style="text-align: center;">30</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">i</td> <td>Technical approach & methodology</td> <td style="text-align: center;">20</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">ii</td> <td>Work plan</td> <td style="text-align: center;">05</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">iii</td> <td>Organization and staffing</td> <td style="text-align: center;">05</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">3</td> <td>Key personnel</td> <td style="text-align: center;">40</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">i</td> <td>Project manager / coordinator</td> <td style="text-align: center;">09</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">ii</td> <td>Air quality expert</td> <td style="text-align: center;">07</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">iii</td> <td>Water quality expert</td> <td style="text-align: center;">07</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">iv</td> <td>Ecologist</td> <td style="text-align: center;">07</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">v</td> <td>Senior Environmentalist</td> <td style="text-align: center;">05</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">vi</td> <td>Senior Sociologist</td> <td style="text-align: center;">05</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td></td> <td>Total points</td> <td style="text-align: center;">100</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td></td> <td>Qualifying points</td> <td style="text-align: center;">75</td> <td></td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	S#	Evaluation Criteria	Points	Total Points	1	Qualification & Experience	30	30	i	Establishment of the applicant company			a	Private limited	06	06 *	b	Partnership concern	04	c	Sole proprietorship	02	ii	Experience			a	At least 15 years of experience or more in environmental and/or social assessment (at least 08 projects), experience with international agencies.	07	10 *	b	At least 02 number of environmental assessment of coal mining/power plant and other infrastructure projects in the region	03	iii	Financial capability			a	Above 200 million	14	14 *	b	150 – 200 Million	12	c	100-149 Million	10	d	50-99 Million	08	2	Approach and Methodology	30		i	Technical approach & methodology	20		ii	Work plan	05		iii	Organization and staffing	05		3	Key personnel	40		i	Project manager / coordinator	09		ii	Air quality expert	07		iii	Water quality expert	07		iv	Ecologist	07		v	Senior Environmentalist	05		vi	Senior Sociologist	05			Total points	100			Qualifying points	75	
S#	Evaluation Criteria	Points	Total Points																																																																																																					
1	Qualification & Experience	30	30																																																																																																					
i	Establishment of the applicant company																																																																																																							
a	Private limited	06	06 *																																																																																																					
b	Partnership concern	04																																																																																																						
c	Sole proprietorship	02																																																																																																						
ii	Experience																																																																																																							
a	At least 15 years of experience or more in environmental and/or social assessment (at least 08 projects), experience with international agencies.	07	10 *																																																																																																					
b	At least 02 number of environmental assessment of coal mining/power plant and other infrastructure projects in the region	03																																																																																																						
iii	Financial capability																																																																																																							
a	Above 200 million	14	14 *																																																																																																					
b	150 – 200 Million	12																																																																																																						
c	100-149 Million	10																																																																																																						
d	50-99 Million	08																																																																																																						
2	Approach and Methodology	30																																																																																																						
i	Technical approach & methodology	20																																																																																																						
ii	Work plan	05																																																																																																						
iii	Organization and staffing	05																																																																																																						
3	Key personnel	40																																																																																																						
i	Project manager / coordinator	09																																																																																																						
ii	Air quality expert	07																																																																																																						
iii	Water quality expert	07																																																																																																						
iv	Ecologist	07																																																																																																						
v	Senior Environmentalist	05																																																																																																						
vi	Senior Sociologist	05																																																																																																						
	Total points	100																																																																																																						
	Qualifying points	75																																																																																																						

*** Note: Firm qualifying all stages will able to win total marks.**



Thar Coal & Energy Board

Government of Sindh

3.	Section-5 - Terms of Reference Sr. No. 6 (Project staffing requirements)	The nomenclature on page 50 are same as on page 17 of RFP Document
4.	Section-5 - Terms of Reference Sr. No. 7 (Evaluation Criteria)	Qualifying Points at page 51 are 75 (as at Page 17 of RFP Document)

The deadline for submission and opening of propoosals are hereby extended. Technical and Financial Proposals are to be submitted not later than **3:00 p.m. on 26.08.2021** and only Technical Proposals shall be opened at **3:30 p.m. on same date and venue.**

All other clauses and terms and conditions of the RFP shall remain the same as per original advertisement.


Director (Admin & Finance)
Thar Cola & Energy Board
Government of Sindh